# RAJYA SABHA

*Thursday, the 20th November,* 1997/
*29thKarrika,* 1919 *(Saka)*

The House met at eleven of the clock, M-. Chairman in the Chair.

**MEMBER SWORN**

Shri Onkar Singh Lakhawat (Rajasthan)

**RE: SUSPENSION OF QUESTION HOUR**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, we take up Question Hour.

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No Question Hour, Sir. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN (Maharashtra): Sir, I have given a notice for suspension of the Question Hour. *(Interruptions)*

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN (Tamil Nadu): Mr. Chairman, Sir, 1 want the Government to lay the Iain Commission's report by suspending the Question Hour. They said that they would be laying the report on the 19th November. Today they said that they would be laying the ATR ...*(Interruptions)*... Till they lay the report, there should be no Question Hour. They have promised to lay the report. As per the rules, I have already given a notice for suspending the Question Hour. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA (Punjab): It has not been listed in today's agenda papers. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No Question Hour.

SHRI S.S, AHLUWALIA (Bihar): No Question Hour. There should be no DMK party in the UF Government. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Mr. Chairman, Sir, let them place the Jain Commission's report. We will not allow this thing.

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: May I just say something? ...*(Interruptions)*...

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please, please the honourable Prime Minister wants to say something. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: We will not allow.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have already given a notice for suspending the Question Hour.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Let them lay the report.

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA: Sir, ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री एस.एस. अहलुवालियाः** राजीव गांधी के हत्यारों को जेल भेजो। **...(व्यवधान)...**

**श्री सुरिन्दर कुमार सिंगलाः** राजीव गांधी के हत्यारों को जेल भेजो। **...(व्यवधान)...**

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please ...*(Interruptions)*... Please ...*(Interruptions)*... Please ...*(Interruptions)*... The Prime Minister wants to say something ...*(Interruptions)*... Can I have my say? I have received a notice under Rule 267 for suspension of the Question Hour so that the Jain Commission's report may be laid on the Table of the House first. This is the same thing as I have got from Mr. Swaminathan. I appreciate the sentiments of the honourable Members; they want the Jain Commission's report to be placed on the Table of the House immediately. 1 want to ask honourable Members, suppose, I ask the Government to place the Jain Commission's report on the Table of the House now and the Question Hour be taken up immediately thereafter, will all of you agree? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SOME HON. MEMBERS: No. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA (Karnataka): Mr. Swaminathan, let me answer that point.

SHRI G. SWAMINATHAN: Mr. Chairman, Sir, the discussion should follow immediately.

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI (Madhya Pradesh): The discussion should follow immediately; otherwise, what is the use of suspending the Question Hour?

**श्री सुरेश पचौरी** (मध्य प्रदेश)**:** पहले रिपोर्ट तो ले होने दीजिए, फिर देखेंगे, पहले रिपोर्ट तो ले होने दीजिए। **...(व्यवधान)...**

MR. CHAIRMAN: I have put a question.

You have given a notice. Suppose I ask the Government to place the Jain Commission's report on the Table of the House just now and if the Government agrees to place it on the Table of the House, then, will you allow the Question Hour to go on or not? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.B. CHAVAN: Sir, I would like to submit let the Government first lay the Jain Commission's report. Thereafter, no other business- should be conducted except. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: We want a discussion on this report.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: Until we see the report, we will not allow a discussion. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI GURUDAS DAS GUPTA (West Bengal): Mr. Chairman, Sir. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री अजीत जोगी:** जब तक राजीव गांधी के हत्यारों को सजा नहीं मिलेगी, आप कुछ नहीं कर सकते हैं, सरकार कुछ नहीं कर सकती है। **...(व्यवधान)...**

We will not allow you until you book the conspirators.

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: No Question Hour.

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI: Our leader was killed. ...*(Interruptions)*... There is nothing in the world more important than this. We have to first discuss this. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री विजय कुमार मल्होत्रा** (दिल्ली): कहीं ऐसी न हो कि इस झगड़े में रिपोर्ट न आए, रिपोर्ट तो रखवा दीजिए **...(व्यवधान)...**

SHRI H. HANUMANTHAPPA: Sir, I have a point of order. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRIMATI MARGARET ALVA (Karnataka): Sir, under the rules, a notice for suspension of the Question Hour is a motion by itself. It cannot be made conditional on something else or tied up with any other motion. It is the one before you for suspension of the Question Hour. We want *that*...*(Interruptions)*... It is not conditional.

MR. CHAIRMAN: Can I say something? ...*(Interruptions)*... Can I speak? ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: This is an emotional issue and there can be no condition on this issue. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI: Sir, she cannot shout at us like this. Madam, you are a Minister ...*(Interruptions)*...

THE MINISTER OF STATE IN THE MINISTRY OF HEALTH AND FAMILY WELFARE (SHRI RENUKA CHOWDHURY): You are talking about rules. I am not ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI: Our leader was assassinated. And you want to cow us down by shouting at us!'

हमारे नेता को मार डाला और हम कुछ न कहें **...(व्यवधान)...** हमारी आवाज को बंद करना चाहते हैं आप लोग **...(व्यवधान)...**

Sir, this has never happened. The Minister is shouting at Members. ...*(Internm/ions)*...

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA: Parliament has only one issue now to discuss the Jain Commission report. That is the issue before Parliament now. There is no other issue.

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, the question is whether to give priority to this emotional issue or not. ...*(Interruptions)*...

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA: There is a motion before the House. ...*(Interruptions)*... Sir, there is a motion before you. Please act according to that. We cannot sit here as mute spectators. ... *(Interruptions)*...

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA: Sir, you must hear the voices of the entire country. ...*(Interruptions)*...

**श्री मोहम्मद सलीम** (पश्चिमी बंगाल): 12 बजने के इंतजार में आप यह सब कर रहे हो **...(व्यवधान)...** आप जैन कमीशन की रिपोर्ट चाहते हो या सदन का काम रोकना चाहते हो **...(व्यवधान)...**

**شری محمد سلیم :** بارہ بجنے کے انتظار میں آپ یہ سب کر رہے ہو ...مداخلت.....آپ جین

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic script

†کمیشن کی رپورٹ چاہتے ہو یا سدن کا کام روکنا چاہتے ہو.....مداخلت.....

SHRI SURINDER KUMAR SINGLA: Sir, you must direct the Government to place the report on the Table.

**श्री अजीत जोगी:** रिपोर्ट से कुछ नहीं होने वाला, रिपोर्ट पर कार्रवाई चाहते हैं। **...(व्यवधान)...** हमारे नेता की नृशंस की गई है, हमारे नेता की हत्या के पीछे साजीश हुई है। उस साजीश में जवाबदार लोग आपके साथ बैठे हुए हैं। हम उस पर कार्रवाई चाहते हैं। **...(व्यवधान)...** और जब तक यह आपके साथ रहेंगे यह हाऊस नहीं चलेगा **...(व्यवधान)...**

Tell us what action you are taking. ... *(Interruptions)...*

Tell us what action you are taking. ...*(Interruptions)...*

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI I.K. GUJRAL): Sir, I am laying it. ...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI: Tell us what action you are taking. ...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI I.K. GUJRAL: I am laying it. ...*(Interruptions)...* I am laying it. ...*(Interruptions)...* I am laying the Report. ...*(Interruptions)...* I want to lay it. ...*(Interruptions)...* I am laying the Report. ...*(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)...* I am laying the Report. ...*(Interruptions)...*

PAPERS LAID ON THE TABLE

Interim Report of the Jain Commission of Inquiry and related papers.

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI I.K. GUJRAL): Sir, on behalf of the Home Minister, Shri Indrajit Gupta, I beg to lay on the Table, a copy each of the following papers :—

(i) Interim Report of the Jain Commission of Inquiry relating to assassination of Shri Rajiv Gandhi and the Memorandum of Action Taken thereon. [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT 2373/97]

(ii) Explanatory Memorandum regarding not laying the Hindi version of the Interim Report and Memorandum of Action Taken along with the English version. [Placed in Library. *See* No. LT 2374/97]

*(Interruptions)*

RE: DEMAND FOR THE DISCUSSION ON THE INTERIM REPORT OF THE JAIN COMMISSION

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, we want a discussion on the Report. ...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI AJIT P.K. JOGI (Madhya Pradesh): Sir, we want to know what action is taken on the Report. ...*(Interruptions)...*

THE PRIME MINISTER (SHRI I.K. GUJRAL): I have laid it on the Table of the House. ...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: What about the ATR? ...*(Interruptions)...* We want a discussion on this. ...*(Interruptions)...*

MR. " CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)...* Please ...*(Interruptions)...* Please ...*(Interruptions)...*

SHRI S.S. AHLUWALIA (Bihar): What action have you taken? ...*(Interruptions)...* What action have you taken? ...*(Interruptions)...* We want to know what action you have taken. ...*(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please ...*(Interruptions)...* Please.

SHRI SURESH PACHOURI: Sir, we are not satisfied with the laying of the Jain Commission Report ...*(Interruptions)...*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Please. ...*(Interruptions)...* You please hear me. ...*(Interruptions)...* Please sit down. ...*(Interruptions)...* The Prime Minister has placed the Interim Report of the Jain Commission of Inquiry relating to the assassination of Shri Rajiv Gandhi and the

†[ ] Transliteration in Arabic script.